# Baartman Kritik

## (1nc)

#### Scientific rationality’s assault on black women is gratuitous and structures modern understandings of STEM. Saartjie Baartman, the Hottentot Venus, is the quintessential example of how scientific spectacle objectifies and fetishizes black women even after death, always relegating them to the realm of the abject – including black women in STEM can’t solve because they are ALWAYS UNDER THE MICROSCOPE

McKittrick 10 [Katherine, professor in Gender Studies at Queen’s University][“Science Quarrels Sculpture: The Politics of Reading Sarah Baartman,”](https://www.dropbox.com/s/hjfjz9c3izu0cle/McKittrick_Science%20Quarrels%20Sculpture.pdf?dl=0)Mosaic: A Journal for the [Interdisciplinary](http://www.katherinemckittrick.com/publications/) Study of Literature—A Special Issue: Sculpture, 43:2 (June 2010): 113-130.

After a decade-long campaign to return her to her homeland, in 2002 the remains of Sarah Baartman, also known as the Hottentot Venus, Sara Baartman, and Saartjie Baartman, were gathered up and transported from the Museum of Natural History in Paris, France, to Hankey, South Africa, for burial. Baartmans dismembered and dissected body had been in Paris since her death in 1815. For about five years prior to her death, Sarah Baartman, identified by her captors as a racially inferior sexual object, was taken to Europe and put on dis- play at private and public events. Her body was examined and prodded for its racial and sexual alterity. Described by some contemporary scholars as "the icon for sexual difference between the European and the Black" (Gilman 231), Bartmaan in both her life and afterlife has represented a captivating exemplar of scientific spectacle. In this essay I explore the creatively scientific possibilities with which Sarah Baartman has posthumously provided us. I address how we might, and can, reimag- ine the political work science can do in relation to Baartman precisely because, in her life and afterlife, it has been biological determinism and scientific racism - evolutionary reports, missing-link tales, nature-savage narratives, and African/European racial-sex- ual bifurcations - that have descriptively coded her. My argument is therefore not con- cerned with authenticating Sarah Baartman, but rather with the ways in which we might differently integrate science and creative labour into our reading practices. Indeed, from her dancing as a human curiosity at Picadilly in London to the casts made of her dismembered body, Baartman is produced as unquestionably less than human vis-à-vis colonial-scientific knowledges and, more recently, through some theoretical analyses that explore the ways in which race, racism, and science depicted and defined her body, her life work, and her history. Rather than following an analytic pathway that understands Baartman as already scientifically condemned, in this discussion I work with a theoretical framework provided by Sylvia Wynter in order to approach the ques- tion of scientific racism differently. Instead of re-centring racist biological discourses in relation to critique, I consider how creative works might intervene in, and nourish, our understandings of science. I am specifically drawing on Wynter's elaboration of Aimé Césaire's "the science of the word" (Wynter, "Unsettling"; cf. Césaire), where she cri- tiques the bifurcation of scientific and creative knowledge and encourages us to con- sider the ways in which these two world views might contemporaneously shift our understanding of humanness - and thus, for purposes of this paper, the extraordinary phenomenon/circus freak/sexual deviant that was, and is, Sarah Baartman. I begin with a familiar, albeit brief, discussion of the gendered and racial under- pinnings of science and the seeable body in order to review how biological narratives underpin questions of social construction. This section of the discussion notices how Eurocentric conceptions of science underpin the social construction of black femi- ninity. I follow with the suggestion that because figures such as Baartman were his- torically tied to narratives of naturalism and primitivism - and viewed as naturally inferior - our contemporary understandings of race, sex, and gender continue to posit this as the foremost way to conceptualize black women. This is to say that many scholarly analyses tend to bring into focus the ways in which positivist science is dis- cursively inscribed on the black feminine body. These analyses are coupled with dis- cussions that uncover the ways in which scientific racism denigrates black women; and, from there, other avenues of inquiry unfold, such as how black femininity becomes the focus of Eurocentric desire and disgust, or how black women are cast as disposable objects (for example, in the work of Patricia Hill Collins, bell hooks, Sander Gilman, and Anne Fausto-Sterling). Put differently, science is often (not always) utilized as the harmful descriptive discourse through which black femininity is "made" into an inferior category. Indeed, while social, economic, geographic, and other factors certainly regulate and produce marginalized groups, Baartman's life story reveals that the weight of historic scientific narratives are substantial: she not only embodies the biased racial-sexual discourses of her day (the evolutionary tables, the taxonomie ranks, the statistics, and the exacting measurements that hierarchically organize humans according to racial-sexual markers), she also demonstrates how our present system of knowledge (the tables, the ranks, the statistics, the measurements) continue to be informed by such discourses. This section is accompanied by the work done by black feminists and other social theorists, whose research discloses and calls into question the colonial underpinnings of scientific knowledge, and thus the ways in which Baartman served as the "yardstick by which to judge the stages of Western evolution, by which to discern identity, difference, and progress" (Sharpley- Whiting 23). I then turn to the sculpture Sarah Baartman , imagined and created by Willie Bester. Drawing on the work of Sylvia Wynter, I suggest that the outcome of Bester's creative labour is a representation of Baartman that centralizes an admixture of past and present violence, creativity, and the promise of science. The overarching intent of my argument is, then, to think about the promise of sci- ence as an avenue through which we can read creative works as breaching "the barri- ers between the natural sciences and the humanities [and] put our narratively constructed world and their orders of feelings and beliefs under scientific description in a new way" (Wynter, "Africa" 59). I am suggesting that the promise of science does not abandon or denounce the scientific contours of our world - biology, physics, chemistry, and so forth - and privilege the social. Nor does the promise of science posit the natural sciences as unerring. Rather, it seeks to explore the ways in which cre- ative texts are valuable not simply because they expose the limits and biases of scien- tific knowledge, but also because creative labour, and the outcome of creative labour, are tied to scientific practice. The promise lies in the collaborative and relational pos- sibilities implicit in the scientifically creative and the creatively scientific - or the human sciences. Within this framework, the natural sciences and the physiological mechanisms that often stabilize descriptors such as "race" are challenged. Instead, the natural sciences, in this case phylogeny and ontogeny (the divergence of genetic life and the origin and development of individual biological beings), are commensurate with and sit alongside creative intellectual thought - what Frantz Fanon (11) called sociogeny (the human interpretation and making of society). What if Sarah Baartman, as we understand and read her now, is a figure that generates and enables a commen- surately scientific and relationally creative space? To biological begin with organism science - and it lives, its attendant grows, and colonial dies. The markers: body the is also body, produced as we know, through is a biological organism - it lives, grows, and dies. The body is also produced through what Simone de Beauvoir called the "data" of biology, those descriptive codes neces- sary to understanding gendered anatomical differences (3-37). The body is also racialized, and through processes of scientific racism, slavery, and colonialism bodies are differentially categorized according to phenotype, sex, class, age, location, and so forth. Thus, the racial-sexual body is a biological organism that lives, grows, and dies in relation to scientific descriptors: the fact of blackness, the data of femininity, the empiricism of racial-sexual difference. Feminists, critical race scholars, and other social theorists have brought forth many studies that lead us to understand the vio- lence of biological determinism and scientific knowledge. As Césaire wrote in 1946, "scientific knowledge enumerates, measures, classifies and kills" (134). As Sandra Harding wrote forty-seven years later, scientific accounts and policies "further the gap between the haves and the have nots" (1). Scientific narratives have also been destabilized and called into question. Feminist and anti-racist theorists, as well as other scholars, have evaluated the ways in which racial-sexual categories are socially produced, rigorously challenging the con- viction that "biology is destiny"; they have explored experience, performativity, insti- tutionalized discrimination, economic marginalization, and resistances to racial-sexual categorization, and thus brought a challenge to scientific racism. But the body, as a biological and lived organism, looms, for it is the seeable materiality of the flesh that, Iris Marion Young argues, contributes greatly to the meaning of the com- munity and the self, who must then act in relation to "unchosen facts" and respond to social structures that unevenly "position individuals in relation to labour and pro- duction, power and subordination, desire and sexuality, prestige and status" (18-20). Racism positions black people as radically outside yet at the same time constituting scientific objectivity and knowledge. As Louis Sala-Molins explains in his discussion of black bondage, "science [. . .] posited a perfect correlation between whititude, per- fection of species, and freedom" (126). This is the science we have inherited. While objectivity, white supremacy, and species hierarchies, among other scientific "facts," are certainly contested, we need to also notice how our lives are structured vis-à-vis a legacy of scientific racism and the ways in which biological differences play out in social systems (see Harding 1-19). Indeed, this legacy can be detected through the biological narratives that underlie what David Sibley calls "geographies of exclusion": criminalized locales, homeless homes, uncontained transient migratory spaces, pris- ons, "underdeveloped" countries, ghettos, impoverished regions, asylums, spaces of otherness, and other sites of racial-sexual struggle. Science can therefore constitute the "idea" of race and position black subjects as "naturally" condemned, disposable and deserving occupants of inferior spaces of otherness. While this racial positioning changes over time and space, and resistances abound, an eerie continuity confronts us, which Paul Gilroy calls "the dismal dance of absolutism" (218). Sarah Baartman fits perfectly into this natural history of condemnation. Baartman, scientific experiment and scientific spectacle, has been cast as a visual and biological truth and an icon of racial-sexual wonder. Through the work of Gilman, Robert Gordon, Rachel Holmes, and others, we can glean that Sarah Baartman was the Khosian woman who was enslaved and displayed throughout Europe in the nine- teenth century for both entertainment and scientific purposes. Of particular interest were her sexual parts, as they purportedly evinced medical and scientific proof of black femininity as naturally lewd, primordial, and inferior. Upon her death, Baartman s body was dismembered and dissected; her skeleton, brain, and sexual parts were put on display, alongside a body cast, in the Museum of Natural History in Paris. Her skeleton and the body cast remained in the museum until 2002. Sarah Baartman's life and afterlife provide an almost perfect collaboration of science and spectacle. Sketches, newspaper advertisements, diaries, and medical doc- uments delineate narratives so racist that Baartman became, and in some cases still is, the iconic representation of the abject, less than human, perpetually condemned and fetishized racial body. The ultimate "nigger-woman" and defective human, Baartman has been "scienced" into degradation. She is repetitively constituted as a historically present "freak," not only according to the colonial gaze but, as Zine Magubane argues, through the ongoing scholarly reliance on Sander Gilman's essay "Black Bodies, White Bodies": through multiple reprints, citations, and analyses Gilman s work is cast as "foundational" to understanding gender and science while it actually valorizes the "ground of biological essentialism" (Magubane 817). In North American feminism, too, Baartman is often produced as scientific spectacle. Classic feminist texts need both Baartman and Gilman to advance discussions of sexism and racism, particularly in North America, in order to identify the violent workings of racial-sexual objectification and white supremacy (Hill Collins; Hammonds; hooks; on Europe see Sharpley- Whiting). While this work has been ground breaking - precisely because it names scientific racism and clarifies the ways in which the black femininity, and black body parts, are transformed into icons of perversity - I am particularly drawn to the work of Magubane, who emphasizes the ways in which analyses of Baartman depend deeply on a theoretically imagined racial-sexual African primitive that is validated vis-à-vis Eurocentric conceptions of science (816-34; see also Gordon-Chipembere).

**The affirmatives rhetoric of success and achievement in STEM begs the question “Who and what are to be sacrificed for such “successes” and on whose and what terms?” – The affirmative’s push for liberal, multicultural inclusion efforts are designed to parade black suffering as part of the educational curriculum**

**Sharpe in 16** <Christina. Associate Professor of English at Tufts University. “In the Wake: On Blackness and Being” January 2016. Duke University Press. Pg 90-91. CS>

The hold repeats and repeats and repeats in and into the present, into the classroom and the hospital. In December 2013, the New York Times ran a front-page feature called “Invisible Child: Dasani’s Homeless Life in the Shadows” (Elliott 2013). As it stands, the series is as much an exposé of Dasani Coates’s “inheritance” of a life of precarity because of the “bad choices” of a parent (primarily her mother) as it is of the massive and systemic failures of programs set up to address poverty and homelessness. The feature focused on Dasani Coates,39 an eleven- and then twelve-year-old Black girl child, and her family (seven siblings and two parents), who live in one of New York City’s family shelters.40 (Family falls apart, in the wake of the hold and the ship, it cannot hold.) In part 1 of the series, readers are introduced to Dasani at home and as she makes her way to the Susan S. McKinney Secondary School of the Arts (“A Place Where Hope Begins & Dreams Come True”)—a school whose already tight space, we read, may be made even tighter with its impending displacement from its third-floor performance spaces by a(n unwanted and contested) charter school. Once the narrative brings us into the school, we are introduced to Ms. Holmes, the principal of the McKinney School, who is described as a formidable woman. A “towering woman, by turns steely and soft,” Ms. Holmes “wears a Bluetooth like a permanent earring and tends toward power suits. She has been at McKinney’s helm for 15 years and runs the school like a naval ship, peering down its gleaming hallways as if searching the seas for enemy vessels. . . . She leaves her office door permanently open, like a giant, unblinking eye” (Elliott 2013, emphasis mine). Martial metaphors and the language of surveillance subtend the logics of the hold. The woman and the school-as-ship both are described as sanctuaries and sites of surveillance.41 Dasani’s homeroom has “inspirational words” like “Success does not come without sacrifice” (Elliott 2013). What brutal imagination positions a site of surveillance as a sanctuary and for whom? But who and what are to be sacrificed for such “success[es],” and on whose and what terms? Reading that Ms. Holmes suspends Dasani for a week for fighting, we are to understand that for Dasani, already homeless, “to be suspended is to be truly homeless” (Elliott 2013, emphasis mine). It is maritime and martial metaphors like ships, success, struggle, sacrifice, and surveillance that activate this narrative of Dasani Coates, invisible child. (I wrote “inviable” instead of “invisible” child, a mistake that is not a mistake because surely to be an invisible child is also to be an inviable child, and as phrases they both appear alongside that earlier sobriquet “former mother” attached to Aereile Jackson.) Dasani is another little girl with the word Ship on her forehead. As Wynter (2006, emphasis mine) has told us: “*The function of the curriculum is to structure what we call ‘consciousness,’ and therefore certain behaviors and attitudes*.” And these certain curricular attitudes structure our, all of our, consciousness. Education in the belly of the ship. Dasani’s narrative is one of her instruction in how to live in a world that demands her death, and it is used as curriculum. That is, not only does the “Invisible Child” series feature the education of Dasani but it is, itself, featured in the Times Education section, as this series becomes part of a larger curriculum as a narrative of individual resilience and overcoming—a “Teaching and Learning with the New York Times” *that consists of the traumatizing and retraumatizing of Black children for the education of others*. Traumatized children being forced to endure more trauma; children in pain being subjected to more pain.42 *Both the school and the woman at its head are described as ships, ships in the storm. But we, in the wake, must acknowledge the ship as the storm.* Recall Morrison’s Sethe and the Haitian girl child with the word Ship affixed to her forehead so that we might ask again: How can the very system that is designed to unmake and inscribe her also be the one to save her? How can the one marked by the ship (see figure 2.5) be saved by being marked for it?

#### Status quo scientific methods and the rhetoricity of scientific expertise in civil society produces objective, disconnected researchers as subject objectifying the object of study – All Attempts at a Perm Fail – Scientific criteria requires black women to denigrate and objectify black women in the effort to receive acceptance and success based on the fascism of scientific acceptance and credibility – The aff and the alt are mutually exclusive

Collins, 2000

Positivist approaches aim to create scientific descriptions of reality by producing objective generalizations. Because researchers have widely differing values, experiences, and emotions, genuine science is thought to be unattainable unless all human characteristics except rationality are eliminated from the research process. By following strict methodological rules, scientists aim to distance themselves from the values, vested interests, and emotions generated by their class, race, sex, or unique situation. By decontextualizing themselves, they allegedly become detached observers and manipulators of nature (Jaggar 1983; Harding 1986). Several requirements typify positivist methodological approaches. First, research methods generally require a distancing of the researcher from her or his “object” of study by defining the researcher as a “subject” with full human subjectivity and by objectifying the “object” of study (Keller 1985; Asante 1987). A second requirement is the absence of emotions from the research process (Jaggar 1983). Third, ethics and values are deemed inappropriate in the research process, either as the reason for scientific inquiry or as part of the research process itself (Richards 1980). Finally, adversarial debates, whether written or oral, become the preferred method of ascertaining truth: The arguments that can withstand the greatest assault and survive intact become the strongest truths (Moulton 1983). Such criteria ask African-American women to objectify ourselves, devalue our emotional life, displace our motivations for furthering knowledge about Black women, and confront in an adversarial relationship those with more social, economic, and professional power. On the one hand, it seems unlikely that Black women would rely exclusively on positivist paradigms in rearticulating a Black women’s standpoint. For example, Black women’s experiences in sociology illustrate diverse responses to encountering an entrenched positivism. Given Black women’s long-standing exclusion from sociology prior to 1970, the sociological knowledge about race and gender produced during their absence, and the symbolic importance of Black women’s absence to sociological self-definitions as a science, African-American women acting as agents of knowledge faced a complex situation. In order to refute the history of Black women’s unsuitability for science, they had to invoke the tools of sociology by using positivistic frameworks to demonstrate their capability as scientists. However, they simultaneously needed to challenge the same structure that granted them legitimacy. Their responses to this dilemma reflect the strategic use of the tools of positivism when needed, coupled with overt challenges to positivism when that seemed feasible (Collins 1998a, 95–123).

#### Reject the Aff in favor of an Afrocentric Feminist Epistemology that will fundamentally change our relationship to scientific study and technological development

Collins 2 [Patricia Hill, Professor of Sociology at the [University of Maryland](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/University_of_Maryland,_College_Park)] Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment. Routledge, 2002.

Lived Experience as a Criterion of Meaning “My aunt used to say,‘A heap see, but a few know,’” remembers Carolyn Chase, a 31-year-old inner-city Black woman (Gwaltney 1980, 83).This saying depicts two types of knowing—knowledge and wisdom—and taps the first dimension of Black feminist epistemology. Living life as Black women requires wisdom because knowledge about the dynamics of intersecting oppressions has been essential to U.S. Black women’s survival. African-American women give such wisdom high credence in assessing knowledge. Allusions to these two types of knowing pervade the words of a range of African-American women. Zilpha Elaw, a preacher of the mid-1800s, explains the tenacity of racism: “The pride of a white skin is a bauble of great value with many in some parts of the United States, who readily sacrifice their intelligence to their prejudices, and possess more knowledge than wisdom” (Andrews 1986, 85). In describing differences separating African-American and White women, Nancy White invokes a similar rule: “When you come right down to it, white women just think they are free. Black women know they ain’t free” (Gwaltney 1980, 147). Geneva Smitherman, a college professor specializing in AfricanAmerican linguistics, suggests, “From a black perspective, written documents are limited in what they can teach about life and survival in the world. Blacks are quick to ridicule ‘educated fools,’ . . . they have ‘book learning’ but no ‘mother wit,’ knowledge, but not wisdom” (Smitherman 1977, 76). Mabel Lincoln eloquently summarizes the distinction between knowledge and wisdom: “To black people like me, a fool is funny—you know, people who love to break bad, people you can’t tell anything to, folks that would take a shotgun to a roach” (Gwaltney 1980, 68). African-American women need wisdom to know how to deal with the “educated fools” who would “take a shotgun to a roach.” As members of a subordinate group, Black women cannot afford to be fools of any type, for our objectification as the Other denies us the protections that White skin, maleness, and wealth confer. This distinction between knowledge and wisdom, and the use of experience as the cutting edge dividing them, has been key to Black women’s survival. In the context of intersecting oppressions, the distinction is essential. Knowledge without wisdom is adequate for the powerful, but wisdom is essential to the survival of the subordinate. For most African-American women those individuals who have lived through the experiences about which they claim to be experts are more believable and credible than those who have merely read or thought about such experiences. Thus lived experience as a criterion for credibility frequently is invoked by U.S. Black women when making knowledge claims. For instance, Hannah Nelson describes the importance that personal experience has for her: “Our speech is most directly personal, and every black person assumes that every other black person has a right to a personal opinion. In speaking of grave matters, your personal experience is considered very good evidence. With us, distant statistics are certainly not as important as the actual experience of a sober person” (Gwaltney 1980, 7). Similarly, Ruth Shays uses her lived experiences to challenge the idea that formal education is the only route to knowledge: “I am the kind of person who doesn’t have a lot of education, but both my mother and my father had good common sense. Now, I think that’s all you need. I might not know how to use thirty-four words where three would do, but that does not mean that I don’t know what I’m talking about. . . . I know what I’m talking about because I’m talking about myself. I’m talking about what I have lived” (Gwaltney 1980, 27, 33). Implicit in Ms. Shays’s self-assessment is a critique of the type of knowledge that obscures the truth, the “thirty-four words” that cover up a truth that can be expressed in three. Even after substantial mastery of dominant epistemologies, many Black women scholars invoke our own lived experiences and those of other AfricanAmerican women in selecting topics for investigation and methodologies used. For example, Elsa Barkley Brown (1986) subtitles her essay on Black women’s history “How My Mother Taught Me to Be an Historian in spite of My Academic Training.” Similarly, Joyce Ladner (1972) maintains that growing up as a Black woman in the South gave her special insights in conducting her study of Black adolescent women. Experience as a criterion of meaning with practical images as its symbolic vehicles is a fundamental epistemological tenet in African-American thought systems (Mitchell and Lewter 1986). “Look at my arm!” Sojourner Truth proclaimed: “I have ploughed, and planted, and gathered into barns, and no man could head me! And ain’t I a woman?” (Loewenberg and Bogin 1976, 235). By invoking examples from her own life to symbolize new meanings,Truth deconstructed the prevailing notions of woman. Stories, narratives, and Bible principles are selected for their applicability to the lived experiences of African-Americans and become symbolic representations of a whole wealth of experience. Bible tales are often told for the wisdom they express about everyday life, so their interpretation involves no need for scientific historical verification. The narrative method requires that the story be told, not torn apart in analysis, and trusted as core belief, not “admired as science” (Mitchell and Lewter 1986, 8). June Jordan’s essay about her mother’s suicide illustrates the multiple levels of meaning that can occur when lived experience becomes valued as a criterion of meaning. Jordan describes her mother, a woman who literally died trying to stand up, and the effect her mother’s death had on her own work: I think all of this is really about women and work. Certainly this is all about me as a woman and my life work. I mean I am not sure my mother’s suicide was something extraordinary. Perhaps most women must deal with a similar inheritance, the legacy of a woman whose death you cannot possibly pinpoint because she died so many, many times and because, even before she became your mother, the life of that woman was taken.... I came too late to help my mother to her feet. By way of everlasting thanks to all of the women who have helped me to stay alive I am working never to be late again. (Jordan 1985, 26) While Jordan has knowledge about the concrete act of her mother’s death, she also strives for wisdom concerning the meaning of that death. Some feminist scholars claim that women as a group are more likely than men to use lived experiences in assessing knowledge claims. For example, a substantial number of the 135 women in a study of women’s cognitive development were “connected knowers” and were drawn to the sort of knowledge that emerges from firsthand observation (Belenky et al. 1986). Such women felt that because knowledge comes from experience, the best way of understanding another person’s ideas was to develop empathy and share the experiences that led the person to form those ideas. In explaining these patterns, some feminist theorists suggest that women are socialized in complex relational nexuses where contextual rules versus abstract principles govern behavior (Chodorow 1978; Gilligan 1982). This socialization process is thought to stimulate characteristic ways of knowing (Hartsock 1983a; Belenky et al. 1986).These theorists suggest that women are more likely to experience two modes of knowing: one located in the body and the space it occupies and the other passing beyond it. Through multiple forms of mothering, women mediate these two modes and use the lived experiences of their daily lives to assess more abstract knowledge claims (D. Smith 1987). These forms of knowledge allow for subjectivity between the knower and the known, rest in the women themselves (not in higher authorities), and are experienced directly in the world (not through abstractions). African-American women’s lives remain structured at the convergence of several factors: Black community organizations reflecting principles of African influenced belief systems; activist mothering traditions that stimulate politicized understandings of Black women’s motherwork; and a social class system that relegates Black women as workers to the bottom of the social hierarchy. Amanda King, a young African-American mother whose experiences illustrate this convergence, describes how she used lived experience to assess the abstract and points out how difficult mediating these two modes of knowing can be: The leaders of the ROC [a labor union] lost their jobs too, but it just seemed like they were used to losing their jobs....This was like a lifelong thing for them, to get out there and protest.They were like, what do you call them—intellectuals. . . .You got the ones that go to the university that are supposed to make all the speeches, they’re the ones that are supposed to lead, you know, put this little revolution together, and then you got the little ones . . . that go to the factory everyday, they be the ones that have to fight. I had a child and I thought I don’t have the time to be running around with these people. . . . I mean I understand some of that stuff they were talking about, like the bourgeoisie, the rich and the poor and all that, but I had surviving on my mind for me and my kid. (Byerly 1986, 198) For Ms. King abstract ideals of class solidarity were mediated by her lived experiences as a mother and the connectedness it involved. In traditional African-American communities Black women find considerable institutional support for valuing lived experience. Black women’s centrality in families, churches, and other community organizations allows us to share with younger, less experienced sisters our concrete knowledge of what it takes to be self-defined Black women. “Sisterhood is not new to Black women,” asserts Bonnie Thornton Dill, but “while Black women have fostered and encouraged sisterhood, we have not used it as the anvil to forge our political identities” (1983, 134). Though not expressed in explicitly political terms, this relationship of sisterhood among Black women can be seen as a model for a series of relationships African-American women have with one another (Gilkes 1985; Giddings 1988). Given that Black churches and families are often woman-centered, Africaninfluenced institutions, African-American women traditionally have found considerable institutional support for this dimension of Black feminist epistemology. While White women may value lived experience, it is questionable whether comparable support comes from White families—particularly middle-class families where privatization is so highly valued—and other social institutions controlled by Whites that advance similar values. Similarly, while Black men participate in the institutions of Black civil society, they cannot take part in Black women’s sisterhood. In terms of Black women’s relationships with one another, AfricanAmerican women may find it easier than others to recognize connectedness as a primary way of knowing, simply because we have more opportunities to do so and must rely upon it more heavily than others. The Use of Dialogue in Assessing Knowledge Claims “Dialogue implies talk between two subjects, not the speech of subject and object. It is a humanizing speech, one that challenges and resists domination,” asserts bell hooks (1989, 131). For Black women new knowledge claims are rarely worked out in isolation from other individuals and are usually developed through dialogues with other members of a community. A primary epistemological assumption underlying the use of dialogue in assessing knowledge claims is that connectedness rather than separation is an essential component of the knowledge validation process (Belenky et al. 1986, 18). This belief in connectedness and the use of dialogue as one of its criteria for methodological adequacy has African roots. Whereas women typically remain subordinated to men within traditional African societies, these same societies have at the same time embraced holistic worldviews that seek harmony. “One must understand that to become human, to realize the promise of becoming human, is the only important task of the person,” posits Molefi Asante (1987, 260). People become more human and empowered primarily in the context of a community, and only when they “become seekers of the type of connections, interactions, and meetings that lead to harmony” (p. 185). The power of the word generally, and dialogues specifically, allows this to happen. Not to be confused with adversarial debate, the use of dialogue has deep roots in African-based oral traditions and in African-American culture (Sidran 1971; Smitherman 1977; Kochman 1981). Ruth Shays describes the importance of dialogue in the knowledge validation process of enslaved African-Americans: They would find a lie if it took them a year....The foreparents found the truth because they listened and they made people tell their part many times. Most often you can hear a lie....Those old people was everywhere and knew the truth of many disputes.They believed that a liar should suffer the pain of his lies, and they had all kinds of ways of bringing liars to judgment. (Gwaltney 1980, 32) The widespread use of the call-and-response discourse mode among AfricanAmericans illustrates the importance placed on dialogue. Composed of spontaneous verbal and nonverbal interaction between speaker and listener in which all of the speaker’s statements, or “calls,” are punctuated by expressions, or “responses,” from the listener, this Black discourse mode pervades AfricanAmerican culture. The fundamental requirement of this interactive network is active participation of all individuals (Smitherman 1977, 108). For ideas to be tested and validated, everyone in the group must participate.To refuse to join in, especially if one really disagrees with what has been said, is seen as “cheating” (Kochman 1981, 28). June Jordan’s analysis of Black English points to the significance of this dimension of an alternative epistemology: Our language is a system constructed by people constantly needing to insist that we exist.... Our language devolves from a culture that abhors all abstraction, or anything tending to obscure or delete the fact of the human being who is here and now/the truth of the person who is speaking or listening. Consequently, there is no passive voice construction possible in Black English. For example, you cannot say, “Black English is being eliminated.”You must say, instead, “White people eliminating Black English.” The assumption of the presence of life governs all of Black English . . . every sentence assumes the living and active participation of at least two human beings, the speaker and the listener. (Jordan 1985, 129) Many Black women intellectuals invoke the relationships and connectedness provided by use of dialogue. When asked why she chose the themes she did, novelist Gayl Jones replied: “I was . . . interested . . . in oral traditions of storytelling—Afro-American and others, in which there is always the consciousness and importance of the hearer” (Tate 1983, 91). In describing the difference in the way male and female writers select significant events and relationships, Jones says “With many women writers, relationships within family, community, between men and women, and among women—from slave narratives by black women writers on—are treated as complex and significant relationships, whereas with many men the significant relationships are those that involve confrontations—relationships outside the family and community” (in Tate 1983, 92). Alice Walker’s reaction to Zora Neale Hurston’s book Mules and Men is another example of the use of dialogue in assessing knowledge claims. In Mules and Men Hurston chose not to become a detached observer of the stories and folktales she collected but instead, through extensive dialogues with the people in the communities she studied, placed herself in the center of her analysis. Using a similar process, Walker tests the truth of Hurston’s knowledge claims: When I read Mules and Men I was delighted. Here was this perfect book! The “perfection” of which I immediately tested on my relatives, who are such typical Black Americans they are useful for every sort of political, cultural, or economic survey.Very regular people from the South, rapidly forgetting their Southern cultural inheritance in the suburbs and ghettos of Boston and New York, they sat around reading the book themselves, listening to me read the book, listening to each other read the book, and a kind of paradise was regained. (Walker 1977, xii) Black women’s centrality in families, churches, and other community organizations provides African-American women with a high degree of support for invoking dialogue as a dimension of Black feminist epistemology. However, when African-American women use dialogues in assessing knowledge claims, we might be invoking ways of knowing that are also more likely to be used by women. Feminist scholars contend that men and women are socialized to seek different types of autonomy—the former based on separation, the latter seeking connectedness—and that this variation in types of autonomy parallels the characteristic differences between how men and women understand ideas and experiences (Chodorow 1978; Keller 1985; Belenky et al. 1986). For instance, in contrast to the visual metaphors (such as equating knowledge with illumination, knowing with seeing, and truth with light) that scientists and philosophers typically use, women tend to ground their epistemological premises in metaphors suggesting finding a voice, speaking, and listening (Belenky et al. 1986). The Ethics of Caring “Ole white preachers used to talk wid dey tongues widdout sayin’ nothin’, but Jesus told us slaves to talk wid our hearts” (Webber 1978, 127).These words of an ex-slave suggest that ideas cannot be divorced from the individuals who create and share them. This theme of talking with the heart taps the ethic of caring, another dimension of an alternative epistemology used by African-American women. Just as the ex-slave used the wisdom in his heart to reject the ideas of the preachers who talked “wid dey tongues widdout sayin’ nothin’,” the ethic of caring suggests that personal expressiveness, emotions, and empathy are central to the knowledge validation process. One of three interrelated components of the ethic of caring is the emphasis placed on individual uniqueness. Rooted in a tradition of African humanism, each individual is thought to be a unique expression of a common spirit, power, or energy inherent in all life.4 When Alice Walker “never doubted her powers of judgment because her mother assumed they were sound,” she invokes the sense of individual uniqueness taught to her by her mother (Washington 1984, 145). The polyrhythms in African-American music, in which no one main beat subordinates the others, is paralleled by the theme of individual expression in Black women’s quilting. Black women quilters place strong color and patterns next to one another and see the individual differences not as detracting from each piece but as enriching the whole quilt (Brown 1989).This belief in individual uniqueness is illustrated by the value placed on personal expressiveness in AfricanAmerican communities (Smitherman 1977; Kochman 1981; Mitchell and Lewter 1986). Johnetta Ray, an inner-city resident, describes this African-influenced emphasis on individual uniqueness: “No matter how hard we try, I don’t think black people will ever develop much of a herd instinct. We are profound individualists with a passion for self-expression” (Gwaltney 1980, 228). A second component of the ethic of caring concerns the appropriateness of emotions in dialogues. Emotion indicates that a speaker believes in the validity of an argument. Consider Ntozake Shange’s description of one of the goals of her work: “Our [Western] society allows people to be absolutely neurotic and totally out of touch with their feelings and everyone else’s feelings, and yet be very respectable. This, to me, is a travesty.... I’m trying to change the idea of seeing emotions and intellect as distinct faculties” (Tate 1983, 156).The Black women’s blues tradition’s history of personal expressiveness heals this binary that separates emotion from intellect. For example, in her rendition of “Strange Fruit,” Billie Holiday’s lyrics blend seamlessly with the emotion of her delivery to render a trenchant social commentary on Southern lynching. Without emotion, Aretha Franklin’s (1967) cry for “respect” would be virtually meaningless. A third component of the ethic of caring involves developing the capacity for empathy. Harriet Jones, a 16-year-old Black woman, explains to her interviewer why she chose to open up to him: “Some things in my life are so hard for me to bear, and it makes me feel better to know that you feel sorry about those things and would change them if you could” (Gwaltney 1980, 11). Without her belief in his empathy, she found it difficult to talk. Black women writers often explore the growth of empathy as part of an ethic of caring. For example, the growing respect that the Black slave woman Dessa and the White woman Rufel gain for each other in Sherley Anne Williams’s Dessa Rose stems from their increased understanding of each other’s positions. After watching Rufel fight off the advances of a White man, Dessa lay awake thinking: “The white woman was subject to the same ravisment as me; this the thought that kept me awake. I hadn’t knowed white mens could use a white woman like that, just take her by force same as they could with us” (1986, 220). As a result of her newfound empathy, Dessa observed, “It was like we had a secret between us” (p. 220). These components of the ethic of caring—the value placed on individual expressiveness, the appropriateness of emotions, and the capacity for empathy— reappear in varying combinations throughout Black civil society. One of the best examples of the interactive nature of the importance of dialogue and the ethic of caring in assessing knowledge claims occurs in the use of the call-and-response discourse mode in many Black church services. In such services both the minister and the congregation routinely use voice rhythm and vocal inflection to convey meaning. The sound of what is being said is just as important as the words themselves in what is, in a sense, a dialogue of reason and emotion. As a result it is nearly impossible to filter out the strictly linguistic-cognitive abstract meaning from the sociocultural psychoemotive meaning (Smitherman 1977, 135, 137). While the ideas presented by a speaker must have validity (i.e., agree with the general body of knowledge shared by the Black congregation), the group also appraises the way knowledge claims are presented. The emphasis placed on expressiveness and emotion in African-American communities bears marked resemblance to feminist perspectives on the importance of personality in connected knowing. Belenky et al. (1986) point out that two contrasting orientations characterize knowing: one of separation based on impersonal procedures for establishing truth, and the other of connection in which truth emerges through care. While these ways of knowing are not gender specific, disproportionate numbers of women rely on connected knowing. Separate knowers try to subtract the personality of an individual from his or her ideas because they see personality as biasing those ideas. In contrast, connected knowers see personality as adding to an individual’s ideas and feel that the personality of each group member enriches a group’s understanding. The significance of individual uniqueness, personal expressiveness, and empathy in African-American communities thus resembles the importance that some feminist analyses place on women’s “inner voice” (Belenky et al. 1986). The convergence of African-influenced and feminist principles in the ethic of caring seems particularly acute. White women may have access to women’s experiences that encourage emotion and expressiveness, but few White-controlled U.S. social institutions except the family validate this way of knowing. In contrast, Black women have long had the support of the Black church, an institution with deep roots in the African past and a philosophy that accepts and encourages expressiveness and an ethic of caring. Black men share in this Black cultural tradition. But they must resolve the contradictions that confront them in redefining Black masculinity in the face of abstract, unemotional notions of masculinity imposed on them (Hoch 1979).Thus, the differences distinguishing U.S. Black women from other groups, even those close to them, lies less in Black women’s race or gender identity than in access to social institutions that support an ethic of caring in their lives. The Ethic of Personal Accountability An ethic of personal accountability also characterizes Black feminist epistemology. Not only must individuals develop their knowledge claims through dialogue and present them in a style proving their concern for their ideas, but people are expected to be accountable for their knowledge claims. Zilpha Elaw’s description of slavery reflects this notion that every idea has an owner and that the owner’s identity matters: “Oh, the abominations of slavery! . . . Every case of slavery, however lenient its inflictions and mitigated its atrocities, indicates an oppressor, the oppressed, and oppression” (Andrews 1986, 98). For Elaw abstract definitions of slavery mesh with the personal identities of slavery’s perpetrators and its victims. African-Americans consider it essential for individuals to have definite positions on issues and assume full responsibility for arguing their validity (Kochman 1981). Assessments of an individual’s knowledge claims simultaneously evaluate an individual’s character, values, and ethics. Within this logic, many AfricanAmericans reject prevailing beliefs that probing into an individual’s personal viewpoint is outside the boundaries of discussion. Rather, all views expressed and actions taken are thought to derive from a central set of core beliefs that cannot be other than personal (Kochman 1981, 23). “Does Aretha really believe that Black women should get ‘respect,’ or is she just mouthing the words?” is a valid question in Black feminist epistemology. Knowledge claims made by individuals respected for their moral and ethical connections to their ideas will carry more weight than those offered by less respected figures. An example drawn from an undergraduate class session where the students were all Black women illustrates the uniqueness of this portion of the knowledge validation process. During one class discussion I asked the students to evaluate a prominent Black male scholar’s analysis of Black feminism. Instead of removing the scholar from his context in order to dissect the rationality of his thesis, my students demanded facts about the author’s personal biography.They were especially interested in specific details of his life, such as his relationships with Black women, his marital status, and his social class background. By requesting data on dimensions of his personal life routinely excluded in positivist approaches to knowledge validation, they invoked lived experience as a criterion of meaning. They used this information to assess whether he really cared about his topic and drew on this ethic of caring in advancing their knowledge claims about his work. Furthermore, they refused to evaluate the rationality of his written ideas without some indication of his personal credibility as an ethical human being.The entire exchange could only have occurred as a dialogue among members of a group that had established a solid enough community to employ an alternative epistemology in assessing knowledge claims. Traditional Black church services also illustrate the interactive nature of all four dimensions of this alternative epistemology. The services represent more than dialogues between the rationality used in examining biblical texts and stories and the emotion inherent in the use of reason for this purpose. The reason such dialogues exist is to examine lived experiences for the presence of an ethic of caring. Neither emotion nor ethics is subordinated to reason. Instead, emotion, ethics, and reason are used as interconnected, essential components in assessing knowledge claims. In this alternative epistemology, values lie at the heart of the knowledge validation process such that inquiry always has an ethical aim. Moreover, when these four dimensions become politicized and attached to a social justice project, they can form a framework for Black feminist thought and practice.

### 2NC Overview

As McKitrick notes: Sarah Baartman was the Khosian woman who was enslaved and displayed throughout Europe in the nineteenth century for both entertainment and scientific purposes. Of particular interest were her sexual parts, as they purportedly evinced medical and scientific proof of black femininity as naturally lewd, primordial, and inferior. Upon her death, Baartman s body was dismembered and dissected; her skeleton, brain, and sexual parts were put on display.

#### Science and technology are always weaponized against black women, from forced sterilization to using them as medical testing ground. This results in a double bind where either their development of solutions relies on black death to be tested and perfected or they have zero solvency because their tech is never fully developed – the alt is a prerequisite to scientific solutions

Beal 70 [Frances, Black feminist and peace and justice political activist] Double Jeopardy: To Be Black and Female, Meridians, Vol. 8, No. 2 (2008), pp. 166-176, Published by Indiana University Press

Bedroom Politics I have briefly discussed the economic and psychological manipulation of black women, but perhaps the most outlandish act of oppression in modern times is the current campaign to promote sterilization of non-white women in an attempt to maintain the population and power imbalance between the white haves and the non-white have-nots. These tactics are but another example of the many devious schemes that the ruling elite attempt to perpetrate on the black population in order to keep itself in control. It has recently come to our attention that a massive campaign for so-called "birth control" is presently being promoted not only in the underdeveloped non-white areas of the world, but also in black communities here in the United States. However, what the authorities in charge of these programs refer to as "birth control" is in fact nothing but a method of outright surgical genocide. The United States has been sponsoring sterilization clinics in non-white countries, especially in India where already some 3 million young men and boys in and around New Delhi have been sterilized in makeshift operating rooms set up by the American Peace Corps workers. Under these circum- stances, it is understandable why certain countries view the Peace Corps not as a benevolent project, not as evidence of America's concern for underdeveloped areas, but rather as a threat to their very existence. This program could more aptly be named the "Death Corps." The vasectomy which is performed on males and takes only six or seven minutes is a relatively simple operation. The sterilization of a woman, on the other hand, is admittedly major surgery. This surgical operation (salpingectomy)2 must be performed in a hospital under general anesthe- sia. This method of "birth control" is a common procedure in Puerto Rico. Puerto Rico has long been used by the colonialist exploiter, the United States, as a huge experimental laboratory for medical research before allowing certain practices to be imported and used here. When the birth control pill was first being perfected, it was tried out on Puerto Rican women and selected [poor] black women (poor), using them like guinea pigs, to evaluate its effect and its efficiency. The salpingectomy has now become the commonest operation in Puerto Rico, commoner than an appendectomy or a tonsilectomy. It is so wide- spread that it is referred to simply as la operation. On the Island, 20% of the women between the ages of 15 and 45 haue already been sterilized. And now, as previously occurred with the Pill, this method has been imported into the United States. These sterilization clinics are cropping up around the country in the black and Puerto Rican communities. These so-called "Maternity Clinics" specifically outfitted to purge black women or men of their reproductive possibilities, are appearing more and more in hospitals and clinics across the country. A number of organizations have been formed to popularize the idea of sterilization such as the Association for Voluntary Sterilization and The Human Betterment (!!!?) Association for Voluntary Sterilization which has its headquarters in New York City. Front Royal, Virginia has one such "Maternity Clinic" in Warren Memorial Hospital. The tactics used in the clinic in Fauquier County, Virginia, where poor and helpless black mothers and young girls are pressured into undergoing sterilization, are certainly not confined to that clinic alone. Threatened with the cut-off of relief funds, some black welfare women have been forced to accept this sterilization procedure in exchange for a continua- tion of welfare benefits. Mt. Sinai Hospital in New York City performs these operations on many of its ward patients whenever it can convince the women to undergo this surgery. Mississippi and some of the other Southern states are notorious for this act. Black women are often afraid to permit any kind of nec- essary surgery because they know from bitter experience that they are more likely than not to come out of the hospital without their insides. (Both salpingectomies and hysterectomies are performed.) We condemn this use of the black woman as a medical testing ground for the white middle class. Reports of the ill effects including deaths from the use of the birth control pill only started to come to light when the white privileged class began to be affected. These outrageous Nazi-like procedures on the part of medical researchers are but another manifestation of the totally amoral and dehumanizing brutality that the capitalist System perpetrates on black women. The sterilization experiments carried on in concentration camps some twenty-five years ago have been denounced the world over, but no one seems to get upset by the repetition of these same racist tactics today in the United States of America- land of the free and home of the brave. The rigid laws concerning abortions in this country are another vicious means of subjugation, and, indirectly of outright murder. Rich white women somehow manage to obtain these operations with little or no difficulty. It is the poor black and Puerto Rican woman who is at the mercy of the local butcher. Statistics show us that the non-white death rate at the hands of the unqualified abortionist is substantially higher than for white women. Nearly half of the child-bearing deaths in New York City were attributed to abortion alone and out of these, 79% are among non-whites and Puerto Rican women. We are not saying that black women should not practice birth control. Black women have the right and the responsibility to determine when it is in the interest of the stru&jle to have children or not to have them and this right must not be relinquished to anyone. It is also her right and responsibility to deter- mine when it is in her own best interests to have children, how many she will have, and how far apart. The lack of the availability of safe birth control methods, the forced sterilization practices, and the inability to obtain legal abortions are all symptoms of a decadent society that jeopardizes the health of black women (and thereby the entire black race) in its attempts to control the very life processes of human beings. This repressive control of black women is symptomatic of a society that believes it has the right to bring political factors into the privacy of the bedchamber. The elimination of these horrendous conditions will free black women for full participation in the revolution, and thereafter, in the building of the new society.

### AT: Perm do Both

The aff and the alt are mutually exclusive – if we prove black feminist epistemology is incompatible with status quo methods and procedures of evaluation then the affirmative can only function as a road block to black feminist methodology that’s our 1NC Collins and Mckittrick evidence – black women can have no other relation to science than as object of study – without a fundamental shift in scientific practice – everytime the aff says we need to increase STEM because we are behind demonstrates the acceleration of science and medical gratuitous violence against the black body, particularly black female bodies like that of the Hottentot Venus and Henrietta Laks – STEM curriculum and the entire body of western science is implicated in making productive black flesh toward the sustenance of white futurity.

#### Both the aff and the perm result in tokenism – ensuring that only a few black women will gain access to STEM as a means of legitimizing the system that will exclude the vast majority of black women

Collins 2000

Black women with academic credentials who seek to exert the authority that our status grants us to propose new knowledge claims about African-American women face pressures to use our authority to help legitimate a system that devalues and excludes the majority of Black women. When an outsider group—in this case, African-American women—recognizes that the insider group—namely, elite White men—requires special privileges from the larger society, those in power must find ways of keeping the outsiders out and at the same time having them acknowledge the legitimacy of this procedure. Accepting a few “safe” outsiders addresses this legitimation problem (Berger and Luckmann 1966). One way of excluding the majority of Black women from the knowledge validation process is to permit a few Black women to acquire positions of authority in institutions that legitimate knowledge, and to encourage us to work within the taken-for-granted assumptions of Black female inferiority shared by the scholarly community and the culture at large. Those Black women who accept these assumptions are likely to be rewarded by their institutions. Those challenging the assumptions can be placed under surveillance and run the risk of being ostracized.

### Perm Extensions

#### Prevailing scholarly norms crowd out black women’s knowledge claims – The aff and the alt are mutually exclusive

Collins 2000

African-American women academicians who persist in trying to rearticulate a Black women’s standpoint also face potential rejection of our knowledge claims on epistemological grounds. Just as the material realities of powerful and dominated groups produce separate standpoints, these groups may also deploy distinctive epistemologies or theories of knowledge. Black women scholars may know that something is true—at least, by standards widely accepted among African-American women—but be unwilling or unable to legitimate our claims using prevailing scholarly norms. For any discourse, new knowledge claims must be consistent with an existing body of knowledge that the group controlling the interpretive context accepts as true. Take, for example, the differences between how U.S. Black women interpret their experiences as single mothers and how prevailing social science research analyzes the same reality. Whereas Black women stress their struggles with job discrimination, inadequate child support, inferior housing, and street violence, far too much social science research seems mesmerized by images of lazy “welfare queens” content to stay on the dole. The methods used to validate knowledge claims must also be acceptable to the group controlling the knowledge validation process. Individual African-American women’s narratives about being single mothers are often rendered invisible in quantitative research methodologies that erase individuality in favor of proving patterns of welfare abuse. Thus, one important issue facing Black women intellectuals is the question of what constitutes adequate justification that a given knowledge claim, such as a fact or theory, is true. Just as Hemmings’s descendants were routinely disbelieved, so are many Black women not seen as credible witnesses for our own experiences. In this climate, Black women academics who choose to believe other Black women can become suspect.

### 2NC Link Wall

#### The black female body is the figure of pathology – making her the subject of scientific experiments toward the purpose of maintaining the health of white women – Just as birth control was tested on black women – The affs advantages are a Rhetoric of the Same – When they note that STEM is necessary for survival and this outweighs black women’s relationship as the object of the scientific and technological development to save white and economically privileged lives they once again demonstrate that black flesh is sacrificeable to maintain white futurity -

Dudley 12

Rachel.  Visiting Assistant Professor at Emory college "Toward an Understanding of the'Medical Plantation'as a Cultural Location of Disability." Disability Studies Quarterly 32.4 (2012).

As Sims tells it, he purchased a spoon and invited two medical students to assist as he tested his new theory on Lucy: "Before I could get the bent spoon-handle into the vagina, the air rushed in with a puffing noise, dilating the vagina to its fullest extent. Sims felt he was viewing something "no man had seen before" because the act of looking into a woman's vagina represented a breach of nineteenth century Victorian social propriety. [4](http://dsq-sds.org/article/view/3248/3184" \l "endnote04) However, enslaved women were excluded from notions of genteel femininity as expressed in representations of Sojourner Truth's "Ain't I A Woman Speech" delivered in 1851 at a women's convention in Akron, Ohio—canonical reading within Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies. **[5](http://dsq-sds.org/article/view/3248/3184" \l "endnote05)** Hence, enslaved women were ideal experimental subjects for medical research especially research involving intimate privates and reproductive conditions. Upon gazing into Lucy's vagina Sims claims he was certainly on the brink of a great discovery and he states, "I immediately went to work to invent instruments necessary for performing the operation on the principles that were self-evident on the first inspection of the first case" (235). This easy slippage in Sims' life narrative whereby he goes from directing the medical gaze into Lucy's vagina to seamlessly applying "self-evident principles" in the invention of the duck bill speculum certainly attests to his power in casting the narrative in a drastically heroic manner. Still, his speculum developed in 1846 would become a major technological innovation in modern gynecological practice. Ten years later, the American Journal of Medical Sciences published his procedures to suture vesico-vaginal fistulas using the duckbill speculum (Sims 1856). It bears repeating that this medical innovation was founded on the bodies of black enslaved women with vaginal fistulas, which can and should be recognized as a kind of disability woven into the economy of slavery. It was the scientific and cultural view of the black body as being always already pathological that created the conditions for Sims to have uninhibited access to them as experimental subjects. Sims would alternate between the women, performing un-anesthetized surgeries on Anarcha over thirty times until he was finally able to develop and later publish a procedure to suture fistulas.

#### The social justice part of the plan is part of a liberal humanist project of recognition and inclusion – it attempts to strengthen the plasticity of the human through a relationship of sentimentality –

Jackson, Assistant Professor of Black Feminist Theory, Literature and Criticism in the English Department – George Mason University, 2016 (Zakiyah, “Losing Manhood: Animality and Plasticity in the (Neo)Slave Narrative,” Qui Parle: 25(1-2); p. 95-136.)

Morrison’s text recalls rhetorical strategies employed by Frederick Douglass, arguably the nineteenth century’s most iconic slave, that diagnose racialization and animalization as mutually constitutive vi- olence under slavery. Douglass’s iconicity is perhaps precisely owed to his dexterous navigation of competing liberal humanist rhetorical modes and affective registers, in particular, sentimentality and religio- scientific hierarchy. While Douglass undoubtedly radically calls into question the biopolitical logics and practices of slavery with respect to both humans and animals, he does so in a manner that reveals the seemingly near-inescapable paradoxes of liberal humanist recognition to the extent that one is conscripted by its terms—appeals to discourses of sentiment and Self. Yet, both sentiment and the sover- eign “I” return us to racialized, gendered master narratives of identi- ty and feeling, which the rooster’s gaze in *Beloved* productively de- stabilizes.5 Mister’s gaze, or the exchange of glances between Mister and Paul D, offers a much-needed critical alternative to sentimental ethics—sympathy, compassion, protection, stewardship, care, and the humane—which has historically been conceived within the terms of a racialized, heteropatriarchal economy of sensibility. In what follows I examine how we might read Morrison as productively problematizing sentimentality as well as gendered appeals to discourses of the Self rooted in religio-scientific hierarchy, as both discourses have historically recognized black humanity and included black people in their conceptualization of “the human” but in the dissimulating terms of an imperial racial hierarchy. Re-constellating the slave narrative genre, Morrison opens up a new way to interpret the genre, not as one that exposes slavery’s de- humanization but rather as one that details the violence of liberal humanism’s attempts at humanization. Unsettling reified interpre- tations of history and literary slave narratives, *Beloved* identifies the violation of slavery not in an unnatural ordering of man and beast but in its transmogrification of human form and personality, as an experiment in plasticity and its limits therein. To put it differently, New World slavery established a field of demand that tyrannically presumed, as if by will alone, that the enslaved, in their humanity, could function as infinitely malleable lexical and biological matter, at once sub/super/human. What appear as alternating, or serialized, discrete modes of (mis)recognition—sub/super/humanization, animalization/humanization, privation/superfluity—are in fact varying dimensions of a racializing demand that the slave be all dimensions at once, a simultaneous actualization of the seemingly discontinuous and incompatible.

### AT: Suffering/Trauma Turn

#### Discourses like the 1NC are a necessary means of exposing the gratuitous violence of medical apartheid

Dudley 12

Rachel.  Visiting Assistant Professor at Emory college "Toward an Understanding of the'Medical Plantation'as a Cultural Location of Disability." Disability Studies Quarterly 32.4 (2012).

It is necessary to note that slavery scholar Saidiya Hartman cautions against the often casual discussion of terror, pain and scenes of black suffering (1997). Within Hartman's analysis, the discussion begins with the passage in Frederick Douglass's slave narrative where he describes the brutality of watching his aunt being lashed. Speaking of such oft-repeated scenes of subjection in slavery: What interests me are the ways we are the ways we are called upon to participate in such scenes. Are we witnesses who confirm the truth of what happened in the face of the world-destroying capacities of pain, the distortions of torture, the sheer unrepresentability of terror, and the repression of the dominant accounts? Or are we voyeurs fascinated with and repelled by exhibitions of terror and sufferance? What does the exposure of the violated body yield? (3) Of course, caution is necessary to avoid a slippage between re-remembering a painful history and promoting the pornography and fetishism of pain. Yet actively remembering the violated bodies of black enslaved women in this medical context can lead to a more nuanced and necessary understanding of the medical plantation as a cultural location of disability as a space where ideology and medical practice converge. Given that pain—due to illness, disability, psychic trauma, addiction to morphine, or repeated vaginal surgery—played no small role within Sims' medical plantation, we should spend more time grappling with the important questions of pain and bodily integrity the case presents particularly in the field of disability studies. The questions raised by the case, as has been suggested throughout this paper, are varied and multiple but revolve broadly around issues of race, gender, space, medical vulnerability and ethics. Black women's particular pathologized bodies were used as the generalized and generative bodies of western gynecological knowledge. The site in which the new knowledge was extracted was a cultural location of disability referred to here as the medical plantation. What is remembered about this location and what is forgotten has everything to do with which epistemological frameworks we use to interrogate it.

### CASE Neg

#### Teachers grant black girls the “permission-to-fail” because of implicit race, gender, and class bias – Unless the aff can fix teachers who denigrate and ignore black students, the Aff Can’t Solve

**Morris 16 [Monique W. Morris, Award-winning author and social justice scholar with three decades of experience in the areas of education, civil rights, juvenile and social justice, Founder and President of the National Black Women’s Justice Institute (NBWJI), an organization that works to interrupt school-to-confinement pathways for girls, “Pushout: the criminalization of Black girls in schools” pgs ]**

Mia described behavior in the classroom, such as playing music in class and cursing at the teacher, that would be unacceptable to me and to most educators. But I could not help reflecting upon her words: “We are doing things that [put] us in that category [ratchet].” Her willingness to embrace personal accountability (“we give ourselves a bad rep”) can be read as an asset, but I considered the other factors that lead teenagers to push limits. Mia’s under- standing didn’t consider the way in which Black girls’ actions are particularly subject to scrutiny and public judgment. When Mia said, “Everybody say that White people think that Black girls is ratchet,” she was accepting society’s marginalization of Black girls as valid—but she was obviously conflicted about it. **Her conflict seemed nestled in the idea that she and her peers *had* to accept as truth this automatic characterization of them as “ratchet”—that they had to behave in ways that provided evidence for this claim just because “everybody” said or believed it was true. Absent a lens that factors in the forces constructing and rein- forcing a “ratchet” identity, the adults charged to care for and educate Black girls may only see them as “self-harmers” who bring drama upon themselves.**62 **And as a function of their own internal- ized, gendered racial oppressions, Black girls who are rarely offered any alternative conception may also believe this of themselves. The ghetto’s impact on the student identity of Black girls also plays out in the classroom as neglect, or what Gloria Ladson- Billings has referred to as granting Black children** **“permission to fail.”**63 In writing about Shannon, a young Black girl in the first grade, Ladson-Billings reflected on seeing Shannon routinely and intentionally refuse to complete a writing assignment. “I ain’t writin’ nuttin’!” Shannon had declared, to which her teacher responded, “That’s okay. Maybe you’ll feel like writing tomorrow.” But it was not okay. To this point, Ladson-Billings wrote, “Although most students were encouraged to write each day, Shannon was regularly permitted to fail. **Her refusal to write was not just stubbornness but a ploy to cover up her inability to read, or more specifically, her lack of phonetic awareness.**”**64 Black girls in classrooms across the country have been granted permission to fail by the implicit biases of teachers that lower ex- pectations for them.** I doubt this teacher intended to lower her expectations for Shannon or treat her differently than her peers. It is safe to assume that this teacher likely believed that she was responding to Shannon with patience and respect. Indeed, teach- ers, like the one leading Shannon’s class, are likely committed to supporting the education of all of their students, but their uncon- scious associations between Black girls and underperformance might lead them to assume that these girls are not capable of performing. This is speculative; there is a dearth of research that actually explores the implicit bias and attributional stereotyping affecting Black girls in schools. Still, it is important to remember that implicit bias is often inconsistent with a person’s stated val- ues, so a teacher may believe that he or she treats all students the same even while aspects of their engagement are reflecting latent biases. The belief that it was “okay” for Shannon not to participate in the activities was facially just a decision to allow her to engage when she was “ready.” However, the determination of her readi- ness was a function of how the educator read her behavior and in- terpreted her attitude toward learning. Once again, the external is compounded by reflex: internalized, gendered racial oppressions give Black girls permission to lower expectations for themselves. Today, Black girls across the country are struggling to make mean- ing of their status as Black, female, and disproportionately repre- sented in high-poverty, low-performing schools. **They use terms like “ghetto” or “ratchet” to describe their condition and are ac- tively engaged in the creation of counternarratives that allow them to move through life with dignity**—but it’s not easy. Pierre Bourdieu and Jean-Claude Passeron note in *Reproduction in Society, Education and Culture*, “Every power which manages to impose meanings and to impose them as legitimate by conceal- ing the power relations which are the basis of its force, adds its own specifically symbolic force to those power relations.”65 **Schools serve a greater social function than simply developing the rote skills of children and adolescents. As Black girls become adolescents, the influence of schools is critical to their socializa- tion.** This is especially important given that **schools often serve as surrogates for influences that might otherwise be lacking in the lives of economically and socially marginalized children**. Coupled with increasingly rampant suspensions and expulsions and a minimal emphasis (in both curriculum and school climate) on cultural competency, trauma sensitivity, or gender responsiveness, **too many of our schools—both those in the community and those operating in penal environments—marginalize Black girls, espe- cially if their curiosity and critical thinking are misconstrued as a challenge to authority.**

#### White Teachers think Black girls are naturally unintelligent - They are actively discouraged in STEM classes

**Wun 16** (Connie, PhD from Mills College, Director at Transformative Research: An Institute for Research and Social Transformation, 2016, *Unaccounted Foundations: Black Girls, Anti-Black Racism, and Punishment in Schools*, Pages 738-740)

Exclusionary discipline practices are used to punish black students for nonviolent infractions, and often times regardless of whether or not infractions have taken place. In addition to the formal types of punishment that constituted the girls’ experiences with school discipline, girls from this study contend that there are other unaccounted forms of policing and surveillance that did not reg- ister under the current conceptualizations of ‘zero tolerance’, nor were they considered institution- alized forms of discipline. These actions are not considered egregious forms of suspension, expulsion or arrest. Yet, according to these girls’ stories, they are still punitive encounters that shape their experiences at school. During an observation of a 9th-grade all-black girls’ course that was created and taught by a black female teacher, students were being asked to assess their experience with the class. This class, which started two years ago, was developed to support black girls at the school. Based upon teacher and administrator observations and school discipline data, black girls were becoming increasingly disciplined. In response, the school created a class for black girls to learn about black history, contemporary black issues, black feminism and issues of self-esteem. When the teacher asked why the students liked the class, they clamored to answer: ‘Because this class if fun’ and ‘I can be with my friends’. One student expressed that ‘in this class, I don’t get in trouble for *every- thing*’. Ms Jones asked her to elaborate. The young woman explained that in all of her other classes it seemed as though any time she did anything, she would get into trouble. She claimed that her Spanish teacher would get mad at her for ‘chewing gum’, ‘laughing’, and ‘talking’, or for acting as if she was talking. Although she did not get a referral for these infractions, she was sent out of class. A number of other students echoed her experience. They shared stories about getting sent out of the classroom for chewing gum or for getting up out of their seat to go to the trash. Students claimed that they were sometimes excluded from the class for entire periods. These frequent expe- riences with punishment were not archived in school data despite the fact that they constituted another level of punishment. These practices are not generally traced within school discipline research in large part because they are not exceptional forms of discipline. Instead they are com- monplace and embedded within the fabric of the girls’ everyday lives, a condition of schooling. At the end of the class, Simone, a black girl in the 11th grade, stayed to discuss her experiences with school discipline. Simone explained that while her school was characterized as ‘diverse’, black students were often subject to hypersurveillance and punishment. Simone explained that sometimes her experiences with school discipline were not recorded. As an example, she recalled that her advanced placement (AP) chemistry teacher once accused her plagiarizing her assignment. As the only black person in the honors class, Simone contended that her teacher’s accusation carried racial undertones. [She thought] I had someone else do it. [She said] I wrote you a referral. She thought I got it off an Asian girl. I said, ‘This is my handwriting.’ She said, ‘I thought it wasn’t yours.’ She could have at least asked. Did she ask every student about their handwriting? Her teacher’s assumption was that Simone had someone else do her homework. The teacher’s purported evidence was that her writing looked ‘Asian’. Not only did the teacher accuse Simone of plagiarism, but she also brought her to the principal to test her handwriting in front of another adult. Simone was asked to write sentences and compare her writing to the assignment under investiga- tion. Although this encounter was not archived as a referral, suspension or arrest, it was a form of policing and punishment that negatively affected her. Simone’s experience with her teacher’s accu- sation provides an example of the racialized suspicion that she felt her teachers had of her and other black youth about their academic abilities and veracity as students. In response to this encounter, Simone explained that she became withdrawn in class. She did not ask for assistance when she needed it and attempted to render herself invisible to her teacher. The underlying logic behind her response was that she wanted to finish the class with minimal encounters with her teacher. Despite completing her work and excelling as an honor roll student, Simone was still policed by her teacher. Her experience was not archived in school discipline data, particularly because it did not count as any formal type of punishment or disciplinary action. Getting sent to the office to demonstrate the authenticity of one’s work is not a formal consequence that is listed in the school handbook. However, it was a part of Simone’s experience with punishment at school. Subsequently, Simone tried to distance herself from the teacher and classroom. Her objective was to get through school without having to engage with her teacher. When asked what she thought about her experi- ence at the school, Simone expressed that she ‘hated’ her ‘diverse’ high school. She disliked the school despite the fact that she was an honor roll student who was recently accepted to several universities. In other words, while Simone was going to be graduating with honors, her experience with school discipline, particularly racialized school discipline, affected her perspective about the school and her entire high school career. Therefore, despite her academic achievements, Simone’s narrative demonstrated that a black female student who succeeds in school can also be subject to gratuitous punishment. While it is useful to examine the uneven rates of suspension, expulsion and arrest, only examin- ing formal discipline policies as the locus for disciplinary discrepancies misses other everyday occurrences of punishment to which black students, particularly young black women, are subject. Hartman writes about the need to chronicle the ‘mundane and quotidian’ that exists beyond the ‘shocking spectacle’ of violence (1997: 4) in order to understand the ‘diffusion of [anti-black] ter- ror’ that characterizes civil society. Focusing only on racial disparities in suspensions, expulsions, referrals and arrests steers observations away from even more common forms of discipline and punishment that are enacted upon black youth, particularly on young black school-aged girls, in school settings – and those that are executed by peers as well. Two 17-year-old black girls, who were teaching assistants for the Lifeskills class, explained that faculty were not the only ones who punished black girls and that punishment extended beyond handcuffs or exclusion from school. Punishment also included perpetual neglect and humiliation. The girls detailed the different layers of emotional and physical challenges that afflicted them, including the ways in which they were policed and rendered structurally vulnerable to authorities and their peers. They shared a story about an anonymously created faux Instagram account that was being circulated around campus. According to these students, there were at least 30 young women featured in this online mon- tage of photos, most of which were of black female students. Although it is already a major concern that pictures of these adolescent girls were circulated online without their consent, each picture was accompanied by a caption that detailed personal details of the student’s life. In one case, one of the pictures included a caption that detailed intimate stories about her family and experience with sexual violence. The girls explained that many black female students were extremely upset by this social media account, especially because they were unable to hold anyone directly responsible. Meanwhile, images of their bodies circulated throughout the internet for their peers to see and scrutinize. The online exhibition of the girls’ images became the impetus for searing tensions among many of the girls they knew on campus. The young women featured in the account tried to find the owner, sometimes wrestling with each other and becoming suspicious of one another. There were at least three fights that ensued because of this account. Girls with pictures posted online began confronting other girls they suspected of unscrupulously ‘posting photos’ of them. According to the girls, friends who were involved in these fights were suspended, and those who actively confronted other students in search of the Instagram account holder found themselves threatened with suspen- sion (and arrest) by administrators. Granted these threats were to deter students from fighting or threatening one another, the impending fear that students would be reprimanded for purportedly asserting their agency disempowered the girls. In addition, although the administrators and teachers purportedly did their best to identify which students might have created the account, the anonymity provided by social media made it difficult to hold anyone responsible. After a few weeks, a principal was able to contact the social media company to ask that the page be removed. While the immediate removal of the page did help alle- viate tensions between students, the fact that youth were able to exploit one another through social media left these young girls feeling helpless. There were few options, if any, for how they could defend themselves and assert their agency. Thus, at the same time that the girls were being exposed on social media, sometimes confronted by peers searching for the Instagram account holder while they confronted others, they were also confronted with the constant threat of school discipline policies. One week later, as a former high-school teacher, I was asked to guest-lecture in an 11th-grade history class on gender, discipline and violence. There were 33 students in this diverse classroom. Most were Latino, Filipino/Filipino-American, and Asian-American. In this classroom, white and black students were the minority. I asked the students to tell me why girls got in trouble on campus. They believed that girls were generally disciplined for fighting. A young male explained: ‘Girls fight on campus the most. Boys fight off campus.’ According to the young men, who initially dominated the classroom discussion, girls fought because they were‘dramatic’ and ‘thirsty’ for attention.

#### The exploitation of black flesh in the plantation economy led to the Medical Plantation and the practice of medical experimentation on black flesh to strengthen the health of white people

Dudley 12

Rachel.  Visiting Assistant Professor at Emory college "Toward an Understanding of the'Medical Plantation'as a Cultural Location of Disability." Disability Studies Quarterly 32.4 (2012).

Sims' aforementioned comment to the plantation owner deserves some further scrutiny because it underscores why Anarcha underwent a shift from a being a forced participant in a plantation economy to an experimental subject of a medical economy. Black enslaved bodies were valued within the political economy of the time only to the extent that they were productive or useful—in the fields, in labor and reproduction, through sexual exploitation, in the house of the master, or as suggested here in medicine. The fistula meant that Anarcha's reproductive capacity could no longer be used as a form of slave capital and she was no longer available for sexual exploitation from slave-holders and perhaps that her ability to work would have been hampered. What is known within the primary record about Anarcha comes to us only through plantation ledgers, medical journals and Sims' own autobiographical writing. It is known that she was not the only woman on whom Sims would experiment. He mentions two more women by first name—Lucy and Betsey, but he may have owned up to twelve whom were used in Sims' series of experiments over four years. Over time, many slave-holders brought their slaves who were experiencing vaginal/reproductive conditions to Sims and he also sought out slaves as well for his medical experiments (Sims 222-247). They were housed in what is being called here a medical plantation.

#### The black has no relation to the medical industrial complex outside of the medical apartheid that cannibalizes the black body toward medical progress

Dudley 12

Rachel.  Visiting Assistant Professor at Emory college "Toward an Understanding of the'Medical Plantation'as a Cultural Location of Disability." Disability Studies Quarterly 32.4 (2012).

so now we come to the second feature of the medical plantation as a space that both symbolically and literally solidified a connection between medical/social vulnerability and medical exploitation. The medical plantation is a reminder, albeit one of the most extreme kind in history, of how social vulnerability and medical exploitation have often coalesced at the bodies of people of color and/or people with disabilities and severe illnesses. In fact the space of the medical plantation is a literal reminder of the ways in which gender, race and (dis)ability not only have historically co-constructed one another, but also have been placed at the center of the development of modern science and medicine (Baynton 2003; Kudlick 2003). Two examples that should come immediately to mind in reference to the medical-scientific uses of black women and notions of pathological embodiment are the aforementioned story of Sara Baartman who was believed to represent the excesses of sexuality and also proof justifying taxonomies of racial difference; or the contemporary story of Henrietta Lacks whose cells were extracted unbeknownst to she and her family and later reproduced for the first time in history through cell cultures, then termed HeLa cells which are still used within multi-billion dollar medical-scientific industries for various kinds of research. [7](http://dsq-sds.org/article/view/3248/3184" \l "endnote07) With Medical Apartheid, medical ethicist and journalist Harriet Washington provides a touchstone in the field of medical ethics; she offers a book length review of the exploitation of black bodies within medical research from colonial times to the present. Importantly, her work goes beyond the oft cited Tuskegee Syphilis study which was designed by U.S. Public Health Services to observe the effects of untreated syphilis in black men in Alabama from 1932-1972. Within her book, she demonstrates that while the black body has been used over and over again throughout history to further medical knowledge, black people have reaped few of the benefits of medical advancement due to vast medical disparities—or to use her stronger language—a deep seated medical apartheid.